

The 4<sup>th</sup> Saturday Morning of Theoretical Physics, 10 May 2014



# Plasmas: The Normal Form of Matter and the Key to Unlimited Energy

## <u>Lecture 2.</u> TURBULENCE: PLASMA UNLEASHED

Alexander Schekochihin (The Rudolf Peierls Centre for Theoretical Physics & Merton College)

Thanks to the plasma group at Oxford/Culham: J. Ball, M. Barnes, G. Colyer,J. Connor FRS, S. Cowley FRS, P. Dellar, W. Dorland, A. Field, M. Fox, J.Hastie, E. Highcock, J. Hillesheim, A. Mallet, S. Melville, J. Parker, F. Parra, C.Roach, B. Taylor FRS, F. van Wyk

### The Machine





[Image: ITER]





[Image: ITER]



Find Theoretical Physics Here!



[Image: ITER]

## Find Theoretical Physics Here!











Now solve this in a torus, knowing S and boundary conditions, get temperature profile T(r), hand solution over to engineers, move on to thinking of dark matter, quantum entanglement, the brief history of time, etc...



Now solve this in a torus, knowing S and boundary conditions, get temperature profile T(r), hand solution over to engineers, move on to thinking of dark matter, quantum entanglement, the brief history of time, etc...

Before we do that, what's D? It's a diffusion coefficient:

$$D \sim \frac{\langle \Delta x^2 \rangle}{\Delta t} \sim \langle v^2 \rangle \Delta t \sim c_s \lambda_{mfp} \text{ standard UG estimate}$$

$$speed of sound \qquad \text{mean free path}$$

$$v \sim c_s \sim (p/\rho)^{1/2} \qquad \text{between collisions}$$



Now solve this in a torus, knowing S and boundary conditions, get temperature profile T(r), hand solution over to engineers, move on to thinking of dark matter, quantum entanglement, the brief history of time, etc...

Before we do that, what's D? It's a diffusion coefficient:

$$D \sim \frac{\langle \Delta x^2 \rangle}{\Delta t} \sim \frac{\rho_i^2}{\tau_c} \text{ in a magnetised plasma}$$

$$\text{TOO SMALL} \\ \text{TO EXPLAIN} \\ \text{OBSERVED} \\ \text{To EXPLAIN} \\ \text{OBSERVED} \\ \text{TRANSPORT!} \\ \tau_c \sim \lambda_{\text{mfp}}/c_{\text{s}} \text{ of the ions} \quad \Omega_i = eB/m_ic$$





# GYRO Simulation Cray XIE, 256 MSPs

Gyrokinetic simulation of the DIIID tokamak [R. Waltz & J. Candy, GA, San Diego]







We need to know about fluctuations because  $\langle \mathbf{u}T \rangle = \langle \mathbf{u} \rangle \overline{T} + \langle \mathbf{u} \delta T \rangle = \langle \mathbf{u} \delta T \rangle$ , assuming for now  $\langle \mathbf{u} \rangle = 0$ 













These ideas are universal: e.g., if you are a (plasma) astrophysicist, you know that the largest plasma objects are clusters of galaxies (containing mostly dark matter and hot, diffuse plasma, not galaxies):



(Abell 262 in optical, http://www.atlasoftheuniverse.com/superc/perpsc.html)



These ideas are universal: e.g., if you are a (plasma) astrophysicist, you know that the largest plasma objects are clusters of galaxies (containing mostly dark matter and hot, diffuse plasma, not galaxies):





These ideas are universal: e.g., if you are a (plasma) astrophysicist, you know that the largest plasma objects are clusters of galaxies (containing mostly dark matter and hot, diffuse plasma, not galaxies):







We want to be able to predict  $D^{(\text{turb})}$ as a function of everything: local equilibrium quantities (e.g., $\nabla \overline{T}$ ), configuration of the magnetic cage, energy and momentum inputs...





So turbulence is the enemy. In order to kill it, we must understand it (also because it's a challenge and we must meet it to keep

our self-respect as a species)





So turbulence is the enemy. In order to kill it, we must understand it (also because it's a challenge and we must meet it to keep our self-respect as a species)





122

time

124 128 128 130 132 134 T Majur Raidus [sm] BES image of density fluctuations in MAST [Movie: Y.-c. Ghim, Oxford]



### **Turbulent Transport** So the "effective mean field theory" **HOT** (~10<sup>8</sup> K) Tfor our system looks like this: $\frac{\partial T}{\partial t} = \frac{1}{r} \frac{\partial}{\partial r} r \left[ D^{(\text{turb})} + D \right] \frac{\partial T}{\partial r} + S$ $D^{(\mathrm{turb})} = \int_{0}^{t} dt' \langle u_{r}(t)u_{r}(t') \rangle \gg D$ edge core $D^{(\text{turb})} \sim u^2 \tau_{\text{corr}} \sim \frac{\ell^2}{-} \sim u\ell$ random walk again, but now particles carrying energy hop from eddy to eddy $\tau_{\rm corr} \sim \frac{\ell}{u} \longleftarrow \text{eddy size}$

velocity

eddy

time

turnover

I have started drawing on some notions to do with the nature of turbulence. In the rest of this lecture, I will attempt a very basic and non-rigorous introduction to turbulence...

xford

hysics.

**COLD** 

#### La turbolenza (how it all started)











"Observe the motion of the surface of the water, which resembles that of hair, which has two motions, of which one is caused by the weight of the hair, the other by the direction of the curls; thus the water has eddying motions, one part of which is due to the principal current, the other to random and reverse motion."





"Observe the motion of the surface of the water, which resembles that of hair, which has two motions, of which one is caused by the weight of the hair, the other by the direction of the curls; thus the water has eddying motions, one part of which is due to the principal current, the other to random and reverse motion."





"Observe the motion of the surface of the water, which resembles that of hair, which has two motions, of which one is caused by the weight of the hair, the other by the direction of the curls; thus the water has eddying motions, one part of which is due to the principal current, the other to random and reverse motion."





So, the basic idea is that a mean, laminar flow breaks up into disordered eddy-like motions







So, the basic idea is that a mean, laminar flow breaks up into disordered eddy-like motions



Turbulence in the wake of Virgin Atlantic Airbus A340 descending to LHR [Image: Greg Bajor on flickr, 2011]




So, the basic idea is that a mean, laminar flow breaks up into disordered eddy-like motions



The Great Red Spot of Jupiter [Image: Galileo, near-infrared (756 nm), 26 June 1996]





Radio Lobes of Fornax A (10<sup>6</sup> light years across) [Image: Ed Fomalont (NRAO) et al., VLA, NRAO, AUI, NSF] So, the basic idea is that a mean, laminar flow breaks up into disordered eddy-like motions







So, the basic idea is that a mean, laminar flow breaks up into disordered eddy-like motions



V838 Monocerotis, 20 000 light years away [Image: Hubble, February 2004]





So, the basic idea is that a mean, laminar flow breaks up into disordered eddy-like motions



V. Van Gogh, *The Starry Night*, June 1889 (MoMA, NY)





So, the basic idea is that a mean, laminar flow breaks up into disordered eddy-like motions

Gyrokinetic simulation of a tokamak [E. Highcock, Oxford]



xford



[Image: Earth Simulator, 4096<sup>3</sup>, isovorticity surfaces; Y. Kaneda]

## Turbulence is Multiscale Disorder





[Image: Earth Simulator, 4096<sup>3</sup>, isovorticity surfaces; Y. Kaneda]

### Turbulence is Multiscale Disorder





[Image: Earth Simulator, 4096<sup>3</sup>, isovorticity surfaces; Y. Kaneda]

#### Turbulence is Multiscale Disorder





[Image: Earth Simulator, 4096<sup>3</sup>, isovorticity surfaces; Y. Kaneda]



# ETG-ki Simulation 4x64.Bnoi.m20)

Gyrokinetic simulation of tokamak turbulence [R. Waltz & J. Candy, GA, San Diego]





#### Spectra: Power Laws Galore

xford





Fundamentally, it is about the way in which a nonlinear system processes energy injected into it.

I will provide a simple example of how that works...



processes energy injected into it.

I will provide a simple example of how that works...



Navier-Stokes Equation:

Kinetic energy:

$$\mathcal{E} = rac{1}{2} \int rac{d^3 \mathbf{r}}{V} \, 
ho |\mathbf{u}|^2$$

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{u} = -\frac{\nabla p}{\rho} + \nu \nabla^2 \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{f}$$
  
dissipation injection  
(viscosity) (some  
mechanism  
for which this

is a stand-in)













 $\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \mathbf{u} = -\frac{\nabla p}{\rho} + \nu \nabla^2_{\uparrow} \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{f}$ Navier-Stokes Equation: Kinetic energy: injection dissipation  $\frac{d\mathcal{E}}{dt} = P_{\rm inj} - P_{\rm diss} = 0$  $\mathcal{E} = rac{1}{2} \int rac{d^3 \mathbf{r}}{V} 
ho |\mathbf{u}|^2$ injected power dissipated power  $P_{
m inj} = \int rac{d^3 {f r}}{V} 
ho {f u} \cdot {f f} igg| = igg| P_{
m diss} = 
u \int rac{d^3 {f r}}{V} 
ho |
abla {f u}|^2$ Steady state:  $P_{\rm inj} \sim rac{
ho u_{
m rms}^3}{r}$  $P_{
m diss} \sim rac{
ho 
u u_{
m rms}^2}{r^2}$ depends on outer-scale if estimated at outer scale quantities only









To balance dissipation with power injection, turbulence makes small scales How small is an easy dimensional guess:

 $\ell_{\nu} \sim (\rho \nu^3 / P_{\rm ini})^{1/4} \sim L {\rm Re}^{-3/4}$ 

"Kolmogorov scale"





To balance dissipation with power injection, turbulence makes small scales How small is an easy dimensional guess:

 $L \gg \ell \gg \ell_{\nu} \sim (\rho \nu^3 / P_{\text{inj}})^{1/4} \sim L \text{Re}^{-3/4}$ injection dissipation "Kolmogorov scale" "inertial range"

#### The Richardson Cascade

1922





Lewis Fry Richardson F.R.S. (1881-1953)

Big whorls have little whorls That feed on their velocity, And little whorls have lesser whorls And so on to viscosity.



#### The Jonathan Swift Cascade





Lewis Fry Richardson F.R.S. (1881-1953)

Big whorls have little whorls That feed on their velocity, And little whorls have lesser whorls And so on to viscosity.

*1922* 



Jonathan Swift (1667-1745)

So, nat'ralists observe, a flea Hath smaller fleas that on him prey; And these have smaller yet to bite 'em, And so proceed ad infinitum. Thus every poet, in his kind, Is bit by him that comes behind.

## The Kolmogorov Cascade





A. N. Kolmogorov (1903-1987)

- Universality (no special systems)
- Homogeneity (no special locations)
- Isotropy (no special directions)
- Locality (no special scales)

Any broken symmetries are restored in the inertial range...

We wish to predict  $\delta u(\ell) = u(r + \ell) - u(r)$ At each scale,  $\frac{\rho \, \delta u(\ell)^2}{\tau(\ell)} \sim P_{\text{inj}} = \text{const}$ 

"cascade time"

## The Kolmogorov Cascade





A. N. Kolmogorov (1903-1987)

- Universality (no special systems)
- Homogeneity (no special locations)
- Isotropy (no special directions)
- Locality (no special scales)

Any broken symmetries are restored in the inertial range...

We wish to predict  $\delta u(\ell) = u(r + \ell) - u(r)$ 

At each scale,

$$\frac{\rho \, \delta u(\ell)^2}{\tau(\ell)} \sim P_{\rm inj} = {\rm const}$$

"cascade time"

Dimensionally,  $\tau(\ell) \sim \ell/\delta u(\ell)$ 

## The Kolmogorov Cascade



**K41** 



A. N. Kolmogorov (1903-1987)

- Universality (no special systems)
- Homogeneity (no special locations)
- Isotropy (no special directions)
- Locality (no special scales)

Any broken symmetries are restored in the inertial range...

We wish to predict  $\delta u(\ell) = u(r + \ell) - u(r)$ At each scale,  $\frac{\rho \, \delta u(\ell)^3}{\ell} \sim P_{\text{inj}} = \text{const}$ 

 $\delta u(\ell) \propto \ell^{1/3}$ 

Therefore,





Recall that turbulent diffusivity is  $D^{(turb)} \sim \delta u(\ell)\ell$  $\propto \ell^{4/3}$ Thus, the largest-scale

eddies make the largest-scale contribution to the turbulent transport

The interesting practical question is what that scale is and how fast these eddies are



#### Further Complications...



**1. Turbulence in a tokamak is not homogeneous:** conditions vary with radius, so we theorise/simulate locally on magnetic surfaces;



[Image: W. Dorland]

#### Further Complications...



**1. Turbulence in a tokamak is not homogeneous:** conditions vary with radius, so we theorise/simulate locally on magnetic surfaces; our "homogeneous box" is in fact a curvilinear flux tube:



[Illustration: E. Highcock, Oxford]

### Further Complications...



**1. Turbulence in a tokamak is not homogeneous:** conditions vary with radius, so we theorise/simulate locally on magnetic surfaces; our "homogeneous box" is in fact a curvilinear flux tube

# 2. Turbulence in a tokamak is not isotropic:

everything is highly stretched along the magnetic field; this requires some new theoretical concepts concerning the interplay of nonlinear energy cascade and linear wave propagation (along the magnetic field)



[Image: W. Dorland]



**3. Turbulence in a tokamak (and generally in plasmas) is not in a 3D space:** in reality the plasma is described by a kinetic equation for the particle distribution function (PDF),

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla f + \frac{q}{m} \left( \mathbf{E} + \frac{\mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}}{c} \right) \cdot \frac{\partial f}{\partial \mathbf{v}} = C[f]$$
particle streaming electric field Lorentz force collisions

The PDF  $f(t, \mathbf{r}, \mathbf{v})$  is a field in a 6D phase space. In a turbulent system, small scales will develop not just in  $\mathbf{r}$  but also in  $\mathbf{v}$  (the  $\mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla f$  term is a shear in phase space, leading to "phase mixing," i.e., formation of large gradients in velocity space). Thus we have to understand the cascade of energy (or, as it in fact turns out, entropy) in a 6D phase space.



**3. Turbulence in a tokamak (and generally in plasmas) is not in a 3D space:** in reality the plasma is described by a kinetic equation for the particle distribution function (PDF),

$$\frac{\partial f}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla f + \frac{q}{m} \left( \mathbf{E} + \frac{\mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}}{c} \right) \cdot \frac{\partial f}{\partial \mathbf{v}} = C[f]$$
particle streaming electric field Lorentz force collisions

The PDF  $f(t, \mathbf{r}, \mathbf{v})$  is a field in a 6D phase space. In a turbulent system, small scales will develop not just in  $\mathbf{r}$  but also in  $\mathbf{v}$  (the  $\mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla f$  term is a shear in phase space, leading to "phase mixing," i.e., formation of large gradients in velocity space). Thus we have to understand the cascade of energy (or, as it in fact turns out, entropy) in a 6D phase space.

#### 4. You don't want to know what #4 is...



• We want to build a machine to tap the energy that fuels stars...



[Image: ITER]



- We want to build a machine to tap the energy that fuels stars...
- Inside the machine, plasma is locked in a magnetic cage and kept out of equilibrium (hot inside, cold outside)...


## The Story So Far...



- We want to build a machine to tap the energy that fuels stars...
- Inside the machine, plasma is locked in a magnetic cage and kept out of equilibrium (hot inside, cold outside)...
- It rattles its cage, breaks into whirls and swirls in its quest to regain equilibrium... To keep it in and keep it hot, we must tame the nonlinear beast: turbulence...

